# Herman H. Shugart, Jr.

# Long-Term Dynamics of Forest Ecosystems

 Computer simulation models, which allow for numerous seedlings and the long lives of large trees, predict how forests will respond to different management techniques

 Forests often represent a tranquillity associated with the apparent<br>changelessness of large trees. Ironically, this tranguillity is largely a product of the human perception of product of the human perception of time. Forests are, in fact, dynamic ecosystems with continual mortality in tree populations balanced by the tremendous reproductive capacities of trees. For each tree that grows to the forest canopy, hundreds of mil lions of seeds and seedlings perish (Hett and Loucks 1971). Heavy seeded trees such as oaks or hickories<br>may produce 200,000,000 seeds in a  $\frac{116}{16}$  produce 200,000,000 seeds in a lifetime, and light-seeded trees like willows or cotton woods may produce billions (Bessey 1904).

High rates of birth and death of trees<br>in combination with their great po in combination with their great po tential longevity make actual observations of the mechanisms of forest<br>dynamics beyond the realm of most dynamics beyond the realm of most investigations. However, there is an increasing need to understand how forest ecosystems are affected by natural and anthropogenic environ mental disturbances. How do certain forests respond to altered atmo

 Herman H. Shugart is a senior scientist at Oak Ridge National Laboratory. He received his Ph.D. in zoology from the University of Georgia and has published on several topics, most of them involving the use of computers in ecology. Darrell C. West received his Ph.D. in botany from the University of Tennessee and is a research scientist at Oak Ridge Na ecology and has produced papers in forestry and botany. Their research has been supand botany. Their research has been sup ported by the Ecosystem Studies Program of the National Science Foundation and by the Department of Energy. Address: Environ mental Sciences Division, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, TN 37830.

spheric pollutant levels and to major or minor climate change? How might responses of forests affect the global<br>supply of atmospheric gases, particularly carbon dioxide? What may be ularly carbon dioxide? What may be the consequences of new forest management schemes: Can we ensure the survival of rare and endangered species in forests? Valuable tools that are being used to answer these and other more basic ecological questions are the computer models of the  $\frac{1}{2}$ changing patterns of life in a forest-called succession-that have been developed over the past decade (Fries 1974; Shugart and West 1980).

 Forest ecosystems are dynamic en tities that may not be static in en time or space. Many of our concepts<br>of ecosystem management are based on the hope that if a forest is left alone it will gradually return to its natural state. "Succession," "wilderness," state. Succession, wildernes virgin forests, and "climax forests" are all concepts that appeal to  $t = t_0 + t_1 + t_2$  basic notion that forest systems should approach some equilibrium state with time. However, research  $\ddot{r}$ using detailed computer models in-<br>dicates that forests in a highly disdicates that forests in a highly  $t$ urbed landscape may remain perpetual state of effective nonequi librium. If the scale of disturbance is large, then the amount of land needed to absorb the effects of the dist bance is also large.  $\Lambda$  woodlot or  $\epsilon$  $\alpha$  small park may never become pristine wilderness, simply because it is too small.

The fundamental data for under-<br>standing the dynamics of forests are the diameters and species of the trees that make up the forests. Tree diameter (typically measured at breast height and denoted DBH) changes for height and denoted DBH) changes for an individual tree as the tree grows.

Over a given area, the statistical dis-<br>tribution of tree diameters changes as a complex consequence of tree birth, growth, and death. Because a forest is  $\frac{1}{2}$   $\frac{1}{2}$  composed of many trees and because the number of factors affecting  $t_{\text{min}}$ life of each tree is large, realistically models of forest dynamics based on individual trees have developed only as computing power has become available.

Before 1970 there were only a handful<br>of these models, but today, owing to of these models, but today, owing to  $\frac{1}{1}$  to  $\frac{1}{1}$  the set the increased availability and the decreased cost of computing, there are over 100 models in the United States alone. These models vary in their mathematical form, level of de tail, success rate, and in the type of forest they mimic. The most elabo rate models include the shape and location of each tree to determine tree competition and growth. The need for detailed mathematical descriptions of the shapes of trees limits the appli cation of such models to commercial forests of one well-studied tree<br>species (Shugart and West 1980). Simpler models, considering only the Simpler models, considering only the probability of one large tree being replaced by another of another species, are often used for more di verse forests. In this paper we will treat models that simulate forest dynamics by calculating the competitive interrelationships among trees in a restricted spatial unit—typically the restricted spatial unit-typically the gap in a forest canopy created by the  $\frac{d}{dx}$  death or removal or a large canopy tree. For this reason they are called gap models.

# Gap models

Since gap models deal with birth, growth, and death of individual trees, growth, and death of individual trees one can incorporate into the model unique biological features of different

#### Table 1. Tests of gap models<sup>a</sup> showing structural and functional responses<sup>b</sup>



a BRIND is a model of Australian *Eucalyptus* forests (Shugart and Noble 1981); FORAR of Arkansas<br>mixed pine-oak forests (Mielke et al. 1978): FORET of Tennessee Appalachian hardwood forests (Shugart and West 1977); FORICO of Puerto Rican Tabonuco montane rain forest (Doyle 1981); FORMIS of Mississippi River floodplain deciduous forest (Tharp 1979); JABOWA of northern hardwood forest of Mississippi River floodplain deciduous forest (Tharp 1979); jabowa of northern hardwood forest (Botkin et al. 1972); kiambram of Australian subtropical rain forest (Shugart et al. 1981); swamp

of Arkansas wetlands forest (Phipps 1979).<br><sup>b</sup> Structural responses describe a forest at one time, or on the broad level of species composition b Structural responses describe a forest at one time, or on the broad level of species composition only. Functional responses allow for more quantitative detail, examining a forest over a period of time.

the species from different part the world. Each model begins  $\mathbf{w}$  the random establishment of small trees in a gap. The models may compute survival based on the number of seeds or vegetative reproductive structures such as below-ground lignotubers, as found in some  $Eucalyp$ - $10000005$ , as found in some Euca  $\frac{1}{1}$  the production of  $\frac{1}{1}$  the production stump and root sprouts by individual

648 American Scientist, Volume 69

 trees that are of appropriate size and species.

(kiambram) to various timber man

agement schemes

A model for a particular forest should<br>include any other factors affecting include any other factors affecting tree reproduction in that ecosystem. For instance, certain conditions are needed for transporting seeds to a<br>germination site. Seed germination germination site. Seed germination and seedling establishment may be

determined by whether or not site<br>have been burned or floode Whether the ground surface is ex-<br>posed mineral soil or organic matter can eliminate, reduce, or amplify the can eliminate, reduce, or amplify the reproduction of a given tree speci-

Gap models all use a basic growth<br>equation that balances the increased photosynthate production of a large tree with the growing respiratory costs of maintaining living tissue as costs of maintaining living tissue as trees increase in size. The models consider shading from taller trees as<br>an influence on the growth of subordinate trees, based on use of the light extinction equation referred to as extinction equation referred to  $R_{\text{max}} = 1.66 \text{ m}$ Beer's law. As conditions differ from the climatic optimum for a given<br>species, or when there is crowding, growth is also reduced. The growth of  $\frac{1}{2}$  and reduced. The growth each tree is computed each ye

 Trees in a gap model are killed as a stochastic function of each species' expected longevity. Further, trees that are growing slowly or that have<br>been damaged by fire are subject to an increased probability of mortality. Trees may also be killed by wildfire,  $T_{\text{T}}$  and  $T_{\text{t}}$  also be killed by wildful blown down by a hurricane, or knocked over when a larger tree falls.

A model can be used in three ways<br>(Shugart and West 1980), and these  $\frac{1}{2}$ (Shugart and West 1980), and the uses can be considered tests. The test-verification-is whether a model can be made consistent with some set of observations. The sec ond—validation—is whether the model agrees with observations that are independent of those used to structure the model and estimate its<br>parameters. The third test—application-is whether it provides correct insights into either basic or applied problems. Applying a model often problems. Applying a model of produces interesting predictions to be tested by future observations or ex periments.

 Gap models have been tested exten (Table 1). They have been used to simulate species composition and behavior through time in response to behavior through time in response to changed environmental conditions and to provide qualitative description  $\frac{1}{2}$   $\sigma$  a forest simulator is to predict locations of changes in forest c position or structure along rea abstract environmental gradients  $\frac{1}{1}$ such a test is the ease with which

 test can be validated. By changing the climatic conditions in a model to agree with those at different eleva-<br>tions on a mountain, and examining tions on a mountain, and examining the mountain to determine if the predicted ecosystems occur in nature, one can assess the accuracy of the model.

 Shugart and Noble (1981) used the  $B_{\text{total}}$  model to predict the change  $\mu$ in Eucalyptus forests at different altitudes in the Brindabella Range in  $t_{\text{t}}$  and  $t_{\text{t}}$  are  $t_{\text{t}}$  and  $t_{\text{t}}$  are  $t_{\text{t}}$  and  $t_{\text{t}}$  are  $t_{\text{t}}$ 1). The transitions from one for type to another appear to be a con sequence of some kind of environ mental alteration, such as climatic<br>change, that affects the competitive relations of the tree species and could not be inferred from a knowledge of the physiology of each species alone; yet the structure and dynamics simulated by the model for different cliulated by the model for different matic conditions match the various real forests. Further, the simulated response of the forests to wildfires of different intensities agrees well with patterns observed on the mountain sides in the region and, more generally, for wet sclerophyll forests throughout New South Wales. Victhroughout  $N_{\rm GW}$  South Wales, toria, and Tasmania (Ashton 198

Other gap models have been tested by<br>simulating different environmental simulating different environmental gradients. The JABOWA model correction rectly predicted the elevation of the<br>transition from hardwood to spruce/  $t_{\text{in}}$  from the  $t_{\text{in}}$   $t_{\text{in}}$  of  $t_{\text{in}}$   $t_{\text{in}}$  of  $t_{\text{in}}$ fir forest in the white Mountains New Hampshire (Botkin et al. 1972), reflected changes of forests in response to different degrees of inundation in the floodplain of the undation in the floodplain of  $\mathbf{t}$ Mississippi River (Tharp 1979).

#### Forest ecosystems

Many tests of the gap models have<br>produced results that could not easily be inferred from a simple tabulation be inferred from a simple tabulation of the attributes of the dominant species in an ecosystem. These results<br>indicate that the whole ecosystem indicate that the whole ecosystem must be considered in attempts extrapolate from the response of dividual species of trees to the dynamics of  $\frac{1}{2}$ namics of forests. It is particularly<br>important that such extrapolations  $\frac{1}{1}$  inportant that such extrapolations should employ models based species-level attributes of tree popu lations.

 By comparing simulated behavior of several different forest systems, we



 Figure 1. Computer models of a forest can allow for the different climatic conditions at various elevations on a mountain. The BRIND model successfully predicted the three vegetation zonations and their locations shown in this

 photograph of the Australian Brindabella Range. Next to the lake in the foreground is a mixed peppermint forest; in the middle ground is alpine ash; in the background is snow gum.

are beginning to formulate general ha plot in a forest were weighed, a predictions of the responses of forest ecosystems to disturbance. This amounts to using a model as if it were toothed curve  $(Fig. 2)$ . We can think a single data point in a study on the of a landscape as a mosaic of patches a single data point in a study on the long-term dynamics of a forest. The of this size, and a gap model can be results that follow are derived from used to predict the fate of each tree on results that follow are derived from the gap models developed at Oak Ridge National Laboratory, but these results are consistent with those ob tained from the JABOWA model (as discussed by Bormann and Likens 1979a, b) and Phipps's SWAMP model (1979).

 A single, small patch within a forest is characterized by the growth of number of small trees until one or two trees grow large enough to gain dom inance over the others. After a h dred years or more these dominant<br>canopy trees die, and a new cohort of canopy trees die, and a new cohort more or less even-aged individu trees begins to grow. These young<br>trees compete, grow, and die until one trees compete, grow, and die until one gains dominance and closes the cycle.

If the mass of plant material on a  $\frac{1}{12}$ 

graph of this biomass over several centuries would be a cyclical sawcenturies would be a cyclical s toothed curve  $(F1g, 2)$ . We can the  $\alpha$  a landscape as a mosaic of patches of this size, and a gap model can used to predict the fate of each tree each patch. By tabulating the region of  $\epsilon$ sponses of, say, a hundred of these



Figure 2. The biomass in a typical small patch<br>of forest, a  $1/12$  ha plot simulated here by the of forest, a  $1/12$  ha plot simulated here by  $t_n = t_{n-1}$ FORET model, fluctuates in response to death of canopy trees and growth of their suc cessors.

1981 November-December 649

patches, the effect of random events<br>(particularly events causing the death  $\left($  particularly events causing the death of canopy trees at a given location) begins to average out, and a largerscale pattern of response becomes observable.

 Bormann and Likens (1979a, b) noted call the "shifting-mosaic steadycall the shifting-mosaic steady state" concept of ecosystem dynam ics. According to this concept, if all the patches that comprise a landscape are simultaneously altered, as by fire or clear-cutting, the landscape mass of total living material, reaching mass of total living material, reaching a maximum as, after a period of reorganization, each patch comes to<br>be occupied by a large, mature canopy be occupied by a large, mature canopy tree. Bormann and Likens felt that such a response was typical of the  $\frac{1}{2}$ hardwood forests of the northeaster United States.

We found this general response in forests that are dominated by a single species or, as in the forests described<br>by Bormann and Likens, when the important species in a forest have similar growth rates and longevities. similar growth rates and longevities. In these cases, the biomass response of the forest through the depends largely on the establishment of a mature forest structure.

Following a large-scale disturbance all<br>the plots representing a forest are simultaneously covered by trees of the multaneously covered by trees of the same age. As these trees grow, the biomass across all the plots increases.<br>One or two large trees on each plot One or two large trees on each plot become dominant through competi tion for light and nutrients. If the species that comprise the forest have similar longevities and growth rate there is synchrony across the plots. If the species also are of similar size at maturity, then maximum biomass of the forest is attained at this stagen because all plots are simultaneously occupied by large trees.

 As these canopy trees die, there is a loss of biomass. Eventually, a mature<br>forest structure emerges as growth/  $\frac{1}{1}$  for  $\frac{1}{1}$  f death cycles of the forest patcher become nonsynchronous. Quasi<br>equilibrium is reached as the average biomass across the plots remains relatively constant. This quasi equilibrium is directly analogous to the "shifting-mosaic steady-state" concept of landscapes, and is consistent cept of landscapes, and is consistent with several other interpretations  $\frac{1}{2}$ equilibrium in landscape systems

650 American Scientist, Volume 69

(Heinselman 1973; Forman 1979) and<br>in ecosystems in general (see, for ex-In ecosystems in general (see, for ex ample, Levin and Paine 1974). A mature forest of this stage in south ern Appalachia features large trees



 Figure 3. Natural disasters can cause the of forest development. Fire in an Arkansas forest changes the dominant species from pine forest changes the dominant species from pine to the larger oak; prolonged flooding in a cy press swamp kills seedlings, thus delaying the biomass peak. A rain forest containing diverse<br>species has no peak at all. For ease of compar species has no peak at all. For ease of compar ison, each response is scaled to have a value of 1.0 at year 600.

 in stands with up to 600 metric throughout the forest are patches where a canopy tree has recently died, containing several thousand stems per hectare and biomass values of 20 per hectare and biomass values of 20 to 40 metric tons/ha; and older patches with larger trees of nearly equal age (Shugart and West 1977).

 We call this dynamic forest response the intrinsic biomass response. A particularly clear case of such a re sponse is found in the alphie ash (*Eucalyptus delegatensis*) forests as simulated by the BRIND model (Fig. 3) (Shugart and Noble 1981). This intrinsic response is essentially that  $\frac{1}{1}$  intrinsic response is essentially that reported by Bormann and Likens (1979a, b) as well.

When forest growth is modified by external disturbances or when the dynamics of the forest involve<br>changes in composition as well as in changes in composition as well as in biomass, the intrinsic biomass re sponse can be altered considerably<br>(Doyle 1981). For instance, in diverse forests such as tropical and subtro forests such as tropical and subtro pical rain forests and southern Ap palachian hardwood forests, trees on disturbed patches have less syn chrony of growth, the biomass peak is lost, and the maximum biomass of curs during the mature phase. How ever, in other diverse forests the first species to colonize disturbed sites<br>attain a larger size than the species attain a larger size than the species that are found in mature forests, and the biomass peak is amplified and greatly overshoots the mature phase biomass values. Examples are when<br>oak (largely Quercus falcata) replaces pine (*Pinus taeda*) as the dominant species in an Arkansas forest, or when alpine ash (Eucalyptus delegatensis) gives way to other  $\bar{Euca}$  lyptus species gives way to other *Eucalyptus* specie in Australia after a fire.

In general, stresses that tend to re duce the rate of establishment of young trees also tend to modify the  $m \cdot m$  intrinsic biomass response. This oc curs, for example, in FORMIS simu lations of bald cypress (Taxodium distichum) swamps under conditions<br>of regular prolonged flooding (Tharp 1979). Because bald cypress seedlings  $1979$ ). Because bald cypress securing cannot be immersed in the floods ex cept for short periods, in many sites the establishment of the species is episodic, requiring two years without prolonged flooding so that seedlings can survive. Frequent wildfires in a snow gum (Eucalyptus pauciflora) forest in Australia are another kind of

 stress that can drastically affect the regeneration of young trees.

 For a mature forest to approach a state of biomass quasi equilibrium, it must contain 50 to 100 patches, each of which responds to independent small-scale disturbances such as the fall of a tree. This number tends to be<br>larger in diverse forests, where the vegetative composition and thus the vegetative composition and thus the forest structure at a given point can be more variable. As the processes that disturb small pieces of a land scape are largely stochastic, the minimum number of patches needed<br>to represent a landscape depends on to represent a landscape depends on how much variation around the landscape equilibrium is acceptable. We have found that forest landscape responses averaged over fewer than<br>50 plots, where each plot is the same  $\frac{500 \text{ p} \cdot \text{p} \cdot \text{p}}{200 \text{ p} \cdot \text{p}}$  for  $\frac{1}{2}$  distribution  $\frac{1}{2}$ size as the area of disturbance, are highly variable as they are overly in fluenced by the particular local  $\mu$ s. tory of disturbance.

## Nonequilibrium landscapes

The need to average the behavior of 50 or more patches to obtain quasi equilibrium at the landscape level equilibrium at the landscape level means that some landscapes may not be large enough to reach equilibrium (Fig. 4). Because the patch disturbed<br>by the fall of a large canopy tree is on by the fall of a large canopy tree is on<br> $h = \frac{1}{2}h^2$  the order of 100 to 1,000 m2, the minimal landscape large enough to absorb the effects of tree falls without leaving equilibrium is on the order of  $10^4$  t.  $10^5$  m<sup>2</sup>, A<sub>n</sub> the orier of the dis- $10^{4}$  to  $10^{6}$  m<sup>2</sup>. As the size of the distribution turbance increases, proportionately more area is needed to average out its spatial effects.

 For instance, most small watersheds that feed small streams in the south eastern United States are large<br>enough to remain in quasi equilibrium when a tree falls, or some other um when a tree falls, or some other small-scale disturbance occurs. However, a wildfire of the size com-<br>monly found in the southern Appalachian region would reduce these lachian region would request the same watersheds to nonequilibrium. These systems are therefore effec tively nonequilibrium landscapes, since large proportions of the small watersheds synchronously respond  $\frac{1}{1}$  to  $\frac{1}{10}$  m each wildfire. The amount and type of vegetative cover may differ over time. It appears that only the larger national forests and recreational parks in the southern Appalachians may be of sufficient size to absorb the



Figure 4. Some forested areas are too small to watershed can be relatively unaffected by reach quasi equilibrium because they are  $\frac{1}{2}$  and  $\frac{1}{2}$  tree, but drastically altered by a subject to large-scale disturbances. A small sive fire.

#### random wildfires and remain in quasi equilibrium.

It is difficult to provide constant<br>levels of habitat for some plant or levels of habitat for some plant or animal species in nonequilibrium landscapes. Such habitat constancy could be obtained by altering the scale of disturbance or by increasing scale of disturbance or by increasing the area under management, but often neither of these strategies is an Appalachian forest landscape, suffi-Appalachian forest landscape, suit cient area is involved so that a n tional park could be managed with the diversity of landscape patches remaining in relatively constant proportions, even given the scale of wildfires in the region.

 However, the amount of forest burned annually by wildfire in Aus-<br>tralia approaches the size of the entire trana approaches the size of the enth range of many of the Eucalyptus species that make up these forests (Luke and McArthur 1978). For ex ample, the effects of a holocaust in 1939 are manifested today in the un stable age and size structure of the total population of the alphie ash (Hillis and Brown 1978). Dispropor tionately large numbers of the population lation were established in 1939 in re sponse to favorable conditions for<br>germination caused by the fire. Trees germination caused by the fire. Tree older than 1939 are relatively rare.

Only the largest island of the Carlo bean, Cuba, might possibly have landscape in equilibrium despite hurricane disturbance. Given the scale and regularity of hurricanes in<br>the Caribbean, the vegetation on any smaller island could be expected to be in an effectively nonequilibrium state (Doyle 1981). An instance is Dominica, where some of the most extensive ica, where some of the most extensive stands of mature rain forest in the Caribbean were severely damaged by hurricane David in 1979.

All the landscapes discussed above<br>have a common feature. Computer have a common readure. Computer simulation of their dynamics, using  $\frac{1}{2}$  gap model, indicates that if enough together the vegetative composition of these landscapes tends, over time, to approach an equilibrium. However, results from similar models identify results from similar models identified the theoretical possibility that landscapes in certain environmental regimes are intrinsically nonequilibrary rium (Shugart and Noble 1981; Shu gart et al. 1980).

For forests dominated by species with quite different typical life historic it is possible to have two stable vege tation types at a given location (Walker 1981). The results from the gap models and from other, somewhat less detailed, models (Cattelino et al.

1981 November-December 651

 1979; Noy-Meir, in press; Noble, in press) indicate that these landscapes would most likely occur in transition zones between different types of vegetation. Griggs (1946) and Leak and Graber (1974) have found evi dence on mountains of the presence of more than one potential and per sistent vegetation type; Marie-Vic torin (1929) and Polunin (1937) have found similar evidence for larger<br>areas. The simplest case involves two areas. The simplest case involves two different types of vegetation that, once established in a landscape, would each be self-sustaining in rel atively constant proportions.

 If a management decision changed the proportion, the landscape would not return over time to its former proportion, but would remain at the new one. I hese landscapes could be most unforgiving to a land manager who made an incorrect decision re garding the stewardship of the land. An undesirable landscape comigu ration, once produced, would not re vert to its former state when left alone; it would remain in the unde sirable state until it was actively transformed to some other state.

 Other aspects of these results should be considered in developing plans for forest management. The ability of gap models to simulate independent great detail gives increased credibility great detail gives increased credibility to their results. The models use at tributes of individual species to de termine the growth of each tree in a sample plot, but they consistently indicate that there must be an explicit consideration of interactions among<br>species to predict ecosystem response. species to predict ecosystem response. The implication is that, for example, pollutant effects measured on indi vidual trees will not necessarily be the same in magnitude or even direction when applied across an entire forest (West et al. 1980). The development of experimental programs to assess environmental effects in forests must take into account ecosystem dynam ics of forests as well as data collection on the performance of trees.

 Our studies indicate that to under stand and manage forests we must think of them as large ecosystems. The studies also indicate that a static<br>concept of ecosystems as unchanging  $\frac{c}{c}$  concept of ecosystems as unchanging in time is not a necessary part of a theory of ecosystem dynamics. A pattern of great change in the forest composition over the past several

 thousand years, borne out by much evidence on fossil pollen (Brubaker 1975; Davis and Webb 1975; Davis 1981), casts doubt on the concept that the forests of eastern North America are, in toto, ecosystems of great an tiquity. The importance of under-<br>standing forest ecosystems lies not in standing forest ecosystems hes hot in their age, but in the relevance of what  $\cdot$  is happening in forested landscapes at present.

### References

- Allen, G. B., and R. T. T. Forman. 1976. Plant<br>species removals and old-field community species removals and old-field community structure and stability. Ecology 57:1236 43.
- Ashton, D. H. 1980. Fire in tall open forests (wet sclerophyll forests). In Fire and the<br>Australian Biota, ed. A. M. Gill, R. H.  $\alpha$  australian Biota, ed. A. M. Gill,  $\alpha$ Groves, and I. R. Noble. Springer-V
- Bessey, C. E. 1904. The number and we cottonwood seeds. Science 20:118.
- $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty}$  Bormann, F. H., and G. E. Likens. Pattern and Process in a Porested Ex tem. Springer-Verlag.<br>
1979b. Catastrophic disturbance and
- $\frac{1}{2}$  1979b. Catastrophic disturbance and  $\frac{1}{2}$  1979b. Catastrophic disturbance the steady-state in northern hardwood
	- ests. Am. Sci. 67:660–69.<br>Botkin, D. B., J. F. Janak, and J. R. Wallis. 1972. Some ecological consequences of a 1972. Some ecological consequences computer model of forest growth.  $\sigma$ . 60:849-72.
	- Brubaker, L. B. 1975. Postglacial forest pat terns associated with till and out wash in north-central upper Michigan. Quat. Res. 5:499-527.
	- Cattelino, P. J., I. R. Noble, R. O. Slatyer, and C. D. M.  $\frac{1}{2}$  $S.$  R. Kessell. 1979. I redicting the multiple pathways of plant succession. Enuir. Man age. 3:41-50.<br>Davis, M. B. 1981. Quaternary history and the
	- stability of forest communities. In Forest stability of forest communities. In Forest Succession. Concepts and Application, ed. D. C. West, H. H. Shugart, and D. B. Botkin. Springer-Verlag.
	- Davis, M. B., and T. Webb III. 1975. The con temporary distribution of policir in eastern North America: A comparison with vegeta-
	- tion. Quat. Res. 5:395-434.<br>Doyle, T. W. 1981. The role of disturbance in the gap dynamics of a montane rain forest. the gap dynamics of a montane rain forest. In Forest Succession. Concepts and Appli cation, ed. D. C. West, H. H. Shugart, and D. B. Botkin. Springer-Verlag.
	- Forman, R. T. T. 1979. The pine barrens of New Jersey: An ecological mosaic. In Pine Barrens: Ecosystem and Landscape, ed. R. T. T. Forman. Academic Press.
	- Fries, J., ed. 1974. Growth Models for Tree and Stand Simulation. Institutionen for Skogs production, Royal College of Forestr Stockholm, Res. Notes 30.<br>Griggs, R. F. 1946. The timberlines of northern
	- Griggs, R. F. 1946. The timberlines of northern America and their interpretation. Ecology 27:275-89.
	- $H$ einselman, M. L. 1975. Fire in the virgin forests of the boundary waters canoe area. Quat. Res. 3:329-82.
	- Hett, J. M., and O. L. Loucks. 1971. Sugar maple (Acer saccharum) seedling mortality. J. Ecol. 59:507-20.
	- Hillis, W. E., and A. G. Brown, eds. 1978. Eu

 calypts for Wood Production. Adelaide, South Australia: Griffin Press.

- Leak, W. B., and R. E. Graber. 1974. Forest Vegetation Related to Elevation in the White Mountains in New Hampshire.<br>MODALE AND DEL NEW 2009 USDA Forest Service Res. Paper NE-29.
- Levin, S. A., and R. T. Paine. 1974. Distur bance, patch formation, and community structure. PNAS 71:2744-47.
- Luke, R. H., and A. G. McArthur. 1978. Bush fires in Australia. Clayton, Victoria: Wilke and Co.
- Marie-Victorin, F. 1929. Le dynamisme dans<br>la flore du Quebec. Contrib. Inst. Bot., Univ. la flore du Quebec. Contrib. Inst. Bot., Univ. Montreal, no. 13.
- Mielke, D. L., H. H. Shugart, and D. C. West. 1970. A stand model for upland forests of southern Arkansas. Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, TN, ORNL/TM 6225.
- Noble, I. R. In press. The role of fire in the ev olution of species interactions, competition<br>and succession. In The Role of Past and and succession. In the Role of Past Present Fire Frequency on Ecosystem velopment and Management, ed. H. A.<br>Mooney.
- Noy-Meir, I. In press. Stability of plant-herhivore models and possible applications to savanna. In Ecology of Tropical Savannas, savanna. In Ecology of Tropical Savanna ed. B. J. Huntley and B. H. Walker. Springer-Verlag.<br>Phipps, R. L. 1979. Simulation of wetlands
- $\Gamma$  impps, R. L. 1979. Simulation of wetlands forest vegetation dynamics. Ecol. Mo  $7.257 - 88$
- $\frac{1}{2}$  Polunin, N. 1937. The birch forests of Green land. Nature 140:939-40.
- Shugart, H. H., W. R. Emanuel, D. C. West, and D. L. DeAngelis. 1980. Environmental gradients in a simulation model of a beech  $y$ ellow poplar stand. *Math. BioSci.*  $\frac{100}{100}$ 163-70.
- Shugart, H. H., M. S. Hopkins, I. P. Burgess, of a succession model for subtropical rain forest and its application to assess the effects forest and its application to assess the effect of timber harvest at Wiangaree State Forest New South Wales. J. Environ. Manage. 11:243-65.
- Shugart, H. H., and I. R. Noble. 1981. A computer model of succession and fire response of the high altitude Eucalyptus forests of the of the high altitude Eucalyptus forests of the Brindabella Range, Australian Capital
- Territory. Aust. J. Ecol. 6:149-64.<br>Shugart, H. H., and D. C. West. 1977. Development of an Appalachian deciduous forest opment of an Appalachian deciduous forest succession model and its application to a sessment of the impact of the chestnut blight. J. Environ. Manage. 5:161-79.
- 1980. Forest succession models. Bio-Science 30:308-13.<br>Tharp, M. L. 1979. Modeling major perturba-
- $T$  Harp, M. L. 1979. Modeling major perturbation tions on a forest ecosystem.  $M.S.$  these University of Tennessee, Knoxville.
- Walker, B. H. 1981. Is succession a viable concept in African savanna ecosystems? In cept in African savanna ecosystems. Forest Succession: Concepts and Applica tion, ed. D. C. West, H. H. Shugart, and D. B. Botkin. Springer-Verlag.
- Watt, A. S. 1947. Pattern and process in the plant community. J. Ecol. 35:1-22.<br>West. D. C., S. B. McLaughlin, and H. H.
- Shugart. 1980. Simulated forest response to Shugart. 1980. Simulated forest response to chronic air pollution stress. 9. Enter on. Qu 9:43-49.
- Whittaker, R. H., and S. A. Levin. 1977. The role of mosaic phenomena in natural com munities. Theor. Popul. Biol. 12:117-39.

652 American Scientist, Volume 69